

Europex positions ahead of the electricity market design trilogue negotiations

Four column table – Electricity Regulation and Directive

Draft	trecast of the Electricity Regulation	3
1.	Delegated operators: Recital 7a; Art. 2(2)ff; Art. 3(1); Art. 5(10)	3
2.	The role of long-term markets: Art. 3(1)	
3.	Balancing responsibility: Art. 4	6
4.	Balancing market: Art. 5	
5.	Day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 6(3)	10
6.	Trade on day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 7(1)	
7.	Dispatching of generation and demand response: Art. 11	13
8.	Definition of bidding zones: Art. 13	14
9.	General principles of capacity allocation and congestion management: Art. 14	
10.	Capacity remuneration mechanisms: Arts. 23 and 24	19
Draf	t recast of the Electricity Directive	23
11.	Market based supply prices: Art. 5	23
12.	Tasks of distribution system operators in the use of flexibility: Art. 32(1) para 2	
13.	Tasks of transmission system operators: Art. 40 (4) and (5)	26



Draft recast of the Electricity Regulation

1. Delegated operators: Recital 7a; Art. 2(2)ff; Art. 3(1); Art. 5(10)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Art. 3(1) 1. Member States, national regulatory authorities, transmission system operators, distribution system operators, and market operators shall ensure that electricity markets are operated in accordance with the following principles: Art. 5(10) 10. Transmission system operators shall publish close to real-time information on the current balancing state of their control areas, the imbalance price and the balancing energy price.	Art. 3(1) 1. Member States, national regulatory authorities, transmission system operators, distribution system operators, market operators and third parties to whom responsibilities have been delegated or assigned, shall ensure that electricity markets are operated in accordance with the following principles: Art. 5(10) 10. Transmission system operators or third parties to whom these responsibilities have been delegated by the relevant transmission system operator, Member State or regulatory authority shall publish close to realtime information on the current balancing state of their control areas, the estimated imbalance price and the estimated balancing energy price.	The Balancing Guideline establishes in its Article 13 a process where transmission system operators are able to delegate all or part of their tasks to a third party. The delegating transmission system operators should remain responsible for ensuring compliance with the obligations in this Regulation. Likewise, Member States should be able to assign tasks and obligations to a third party. Such assignment should be limited to tasks and obligations executed at national level (such as imbalance settlement). The limitations to the assignment should not lead to unnecessary changes to the existing national arrangements. However, transmission system operators should remain responsible for the tasks entrusted to them pursuant to Article 40 of the [recast Electricity Directive].	Recital 7a; Art. 2(2)ff; Art. 3(1); Art. 5(10): As Council. Justification: 'Delegated operators' are non-TSO third parties who have been assigned or delegated essential tasks related to the balancing market by a Member State or a Transmission System Operator (TSO). This includes, for example, imbalance settlement and calculation or data publication. It is important that the European Parliament now aligns with the Council's position to ensure clarity around these existing arrangements. These delegated operators have already been recognised in the Network Code on Emergency and Restoration (NC ER) and the Electricity Balancing Guideline (EB GL) as 'third parties'. Europex published



Art 2(2)ff	a paper in November 2017 explaining these arrangements in more detail. ¹
'delegated operator' means an entity	these arrangements in more detain
to whom specific tasks or obligations	
entrusted to a transmission system	
operator or nominated electricity	
market operator under this Regulation	
or any other Regulation, Directive,	
Network Code or Guideline have been	
delegated by that transmission system	
operator or nominated electricity	
market operator or have been assigned	
by a Member State or [] Regulatory	
Authority;	
Art 3(1)	
1	
Member States, national regulatory	
authorities, transmission system	
operators, distribution system	
operators, [] market operators and	
delegated operators shall ensure that	
electricity markets are operated in	
accordance with the following	
principles:	
Art 5(10)	
Transmission system operators shall	
publish, as soon as possible but not	
later than 30 minutes after [] real-	
time, the information on the current	
system balance [] of their []	
scheduling areas and the estimated []	

¹ https://www.europex.org/position-papers/the-essential-tasks-of-third-party-market-operators-in-the-electricity-market/



	balancing energy prices. To the extent that responsibility for provision of this information has been assigned or delegated to a third party, in accordance with [] the Balancing Guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009Article, those parties will be responsible for meeting the requirements of this Article.	
--	---	--

2. The role of long-term markets: Art. 3(1)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Principles regarding the operation of	(n) long-term hedging opportunities,	(n) in order to [] allow market	Art. 3(1): As Parliament.
electricity markets - Art. 3(1)	which allow market participants to	participants to be protected [] against	Luckiffications Francisco such asset the
(n) long-term hedging opportunities,	hedge against price volatility risks on a	price volatility risks on a market basis,	Justification: Europex welcomes the
which allow market participants to	market basis, and mitigate uncertainty	and [] mitigate uncertainty on future	Parliament's recognition that any
hedge against price volatility risks on a	on future returns on investment shall	returns on investment, long-term	regulatory changes must take into
market basis, and eliminate uncertainty	be tradable on exchanges in a	hedging opportunities shall be tradable	account effects on both short-term and
on future returns on investment shall	transparent manner subject to	on exchanges in a transparent manner	long-term forward and futures markets
be tradable on exchanges in a	compliance with EU treaty rules on	and long- term supply contracts shall	and products. The importance of long-
transparent manner subject to	competition while current products	be negotiable over the counter, subject	term markets and products should be
compliance with EU treaty rules on	offered on exchanges should be	to compliance with EU treaty rules on	reflected in the final text.
competition.	further expanded and promoted at	competition.	
	Union level; Regulatory changes shall		The Council's General Approach includes
	take into account effects on both		a mention of over the counter (OTC)
	short-term and long-term forward and		long-term hedging opportunities.
	futures markets and products.		Europex believes that the choice of



	instruments for long-term hedg should be left up to market participal and there is no need to specify the of instruments in this Regulation.	ıts,

3. Balancing responsibility: Art. 4

Commission proposal	European Parliament (ITRE	Council (General Approach	Europex position
COM(2016) 861 final/2 published	report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	published 20 Dec 2017)	
23 Feb 2017		Document: 15879/17	
Balancing responsibility (Art. 4)	2a. When a Member State chooses to	Balance[] responsibility (Art. 4)	Art. 4(2): Member States may provide []
	provide a derogation in accordance		derogations from [] balancing
1. All market participants shall aim for	with Article 4(2), it shall ensure that the	All market participants [] shall be []	responsibility only in the following cases:
system balance and shall be financially	financial responsibilities for imbalances	responsible for the imbalances they	
responsible for imbalances they cause in	are fulfilled by another party.	cause in the system []. To that end, the	(b) power generating facility, using
the system. They shall either be balance		market participants [] shall either be	renewable energy sources or high-
responsible parties or delegate their		balance responsible parties or	efficiency cogeneration with a total
responsibility to a balance responsible		contractually delegate their	installed electricity capacity of less than
party of their choice.		responsibility to a balance responsible	[] 250 kW; _
		party of their choice. In accordance with	
2. Member States may provide for		the Balancing Guideline adopted on the	Justification: The most efficient way to
derogation from balance responsibility		basis of Article 17 and 18 of the	achieve emissions reduction and an
in respect of:		Regulation 714/2009, each balance responsible party shall be financially	overall increase in welfare is through
		responsible for its imbalances and	technology neutral market rules. Well-
(a) demonstration projects;		strive to be balanced or help the power	functioning spot, long-term and
(1)		system to be balanced.	balancing markets, which properly reflect the market value of power,
(b) generating installations using			provide the necessary price signals to
renewable energy sources or high-		Member States may provide []	drive optimal technology choices and
		derogations from [] balancing	, ,



efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 500 kW;

- (c) installations benefitting from support approved by the Commission under Union State aid rules pursuant to Articles 107 to 109 TFEU, and commissioned prior to [OP: entry into force]. Member States may, subject to Union state aid rules, incentivize market participants which are fully or partly exempted from balancing responsibility to accept full balancing responsibility against appropriate compensation.
- 3. From 1 January 2026, point (b) of paragraph 2 shall apply only to generating installations using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 250 kW.

responsibility only in the following cases:

- (a) demonstration projects for emerging technologies as defined in Article 66 and 67 of Regulation (EU) 2016/63112;
- (b) **power generating facility**, using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration with a **total** installed electricity capacity of less than [] **250 kW**;
- (c) Without prejudice to contracts concluded before [entry into force of the legislation], and installations benefitting from support approved by the Commission under Union State aid rules pursuant to Articles 107 to 109 TFEU, and commissioned prior to [OP: entry into force]. Member States may, [] without prejudice to Articles 107 and 108 TFEU, incentivise market participants which are fully or partly exempted from balancing responsibility to accept full balancing responsibility. []
- 2a. When a Member State chooses to provide a derogation according to Article 4 (2), they need to ensure that the financial responsibilities of imbalances are fulfilled by another party.

It is vital that all market participants are financially responsible for imbalances they cause. Derogations for renewable producers are inefficient market distortions and may generate excess costs ultimately borne by the consumer. Renewable producers can normally delegate their balance responsibility to a third-party provider of their choice in order to fulfil the obligation.

As very-low marginal cost renewable generation has been growing rapidly, and over time has become increasingly cost-competitive, this principle on balance responsibility is important already today. It will become increasingly important in the future as the share of renewable production will grow even further while conventional thermal power plants can be expected to gradually be phased out.

If some RES generators are exempted from imbalance responsibility, a potentially massive deployment could impact the system operation and the market in such a way that could actually incentivise a discriminatory treatment by system operators through implicit or explicit preventive measures aimed to limit such impact.



3. For power generating facilities	
commissioned after 1 January 2026	
point (b) of paragraph 2 shall apply only	
to renewable energy sources or high-	
efficiency cogeneration with an tota	
installed electricity capacity of less than	
[] 150 kW. Member States may apply a	
lower threshold.	

4. Balancing market: Art. 5

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Art. 5 Balancing market		0	Art. 5(2): As Council.
2. Balancing markets shall be organised in such a way as to ensure effective non-discrimination between market participants taking account of the different technical capability of generation from variable renewable sources and demand side response and storage.	2. Balancing markets shall be organised in such a way as to ensure effective non-discrimination between market participants. All generation, including from variable renewable sources, demand side response and storage shall be enabled to participate on equal footing in balancing markets, taking account of the different technical	2. Balancing markets, including prequalification processes, shall be organised in such a way as to: (a) ensure effective non-discrimination between market participants taking account of the different technical needs of the power system, a transparent and technologically neutral definition	Justification: With respect to balancing markets, Europex supports the principles of transparent and technologically neutral definition of services and market-based procurement. Art. 5(8): As Council.
8. The procurement of balancing capacity shall be facilitated on a	capability.	of services and their transparent, market based procurement [],	Justification: The allocation of cross- zonal capacity for the exchange of
regional level in accordance with point 8 of Annex I. The procurement shall be	8. The procurement of balancing capacity shall be performed by the		balancing capacity is already addressed in the Electricity Balancing Guideline
based on a primary market and organised in such a way as to be non-	transmission system operators. The procurement shall be based on a		(Chapter 2 of Title IV), which provides TSOs with a number of options. Setting a



discriminatory between market participants in the prequalification process individually or through aggregation.

10. Transmission system operators shall publish close to real-time information on the current balancing state of their control areas, the imbalance price and the balancing energy price.

primary market and organised in such a way as to be non-discriminatory between market participants in the prequalification process, whether market participants participate individually or through aggregation subject to technical constraints inherent in managing networks. The reservation of cross-zonal capacity for the exchange of balancing capacity shall be limited to 5% of the available capacity for the exchange of energy of the previous relevant calendar year between the respective bidding zones.

10. Transmission system operators or third parties to whom these responsibilities have been delegated by the relevant transmission system operator, Member State or regulatory authority shall publish close to real-time information on the current balancing state of their control areas, the estimated imbalance price and the estimated balancing energy price.

10a. Member States shall report on the functioning and transparency of, and access to, in particular by small providers, the balancing markets, in particular for the purpose of Article 4,

(b) ensure access to all prequalified market participants, be it individual or through aggregation;

(c) respect the need to accommodate increasing shares of variable generation as well as increased demand responsiveness and the advent of new technologies.

П

8. The procurement of balancing capacity shall be **performed by the** transmission system operators, [] facilitated on a regional level [] in accordance with Balancing Guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009. The procurement of balancing capacity shall be marketbased [] and organised in such a way as to be non- discriminatory between market participants the pregualification process individually or through aggregation in accordance with paragraph 4 of Article 40 of the [recast Electricity Directive]. []

10. Transmission system operators shall publish, as soon as possible but not

percentage limit as in Art. 5(8) as amended by the Parliament) would cut across these provisions in the EB GL, which entered into force in December 2017.

Any pre-allocation of cross-zonal capacity should be subject to strict economic and operational justification, as well as transparency provisions if and when applied, since it affects the price formation in the intraday, day ahead and forward markets.

Art. 5(10): The Electricity Balancing Guideline (EB GL) and the Transparency Regulation² already contain provisions on the publication of system balance information. The publication of imbalance prices and balancing energy prices are also addressed by the Transparency Regulation.

Introducing new requirements in this Regulation, while different requirements are already in force, would lead to overlapping and potentially incoherent legislation. This should be avoided, and the wording of the existing legislation maintained.

² Commission Regulation (EU) of 14 June 2013 on submission and publication of data in electricity markets and amending Annex I to Regulation (EC) No 714/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council.



through the reporting procedur	e on later than 30 minutes after [] real-time,
the internal energy market laid	down the information on the current system
in Article 21 of Regulation/	balance [] of their [] scheduling areas
[Governance of the Energy Unio	on]. and the estimated [] balancing energy
	prices. To the extent that responsibility
	for provision of this information has
	been assigned or delegated to a third
	party, in accordance with [] the
	Balancing Guideline adopted on the
	basis of Article 18 of the Regulation
	714/2009Article, those parties will be
	responsible for meeting the
	requirements of this Article.

5. Day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 6(3)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Art. 6(3) day-ahead and intraday markets 3. Market operators shall be free to develop products and trading opportunities that suit market participants' demand and needs and ensure that all market participants are able to access the market individually or through aggregation. They shall respect the need to accommodate increasing shares of variable generation as well as increased demand responsiveness and the advent of new technologies.	3. Market operators shall be free to develop products and trading opportunities that suit market participants' demand and needs and ensure that all market participants are able to access the market individually or through aggregation. They shall respect the need to accommodate increasing shares of variable generation and energy storage as well as increased demand responsiveness and the advent of new technologies.	[deleted]	Art. 6(3): Market operators, such as NEMOs, need to be given sufficient flexibility to develop innovative and competitive products as well as trading opportunities suiting market participants' needs, as initially foreseen in the Commission's proposal (Art. 6(3)). Naturally, this flexibility to implement products would be subject to the fulfilment of all relevant regulation.



6. Trade on day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 7(1)

Commission proposal	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach	Europex position
COM(2016) 861 final/2 published	report as voted 21 reb 2010)	published 20 Dec 2017)	
23 Feb 2017		Document: 15879/17	
Art. 7(1) Trade on day-ahead and	1. Market operators shall allow market	1. Nominated electricity market	Art. 7(1): As Commission.
intraday markets	participants to trade energy as close to	operators shall allow market	
1. Market operators shall allow market	real time as possible and at least up to	participants to trade energy as close to	Justification: The Parliament's positions
participants to trade energy as close to	15 minutes before real time across all	real time as possible and at least up to	on gate closure time is in direct
real time as possible and at least up to	bidding zones.	the intraday cross-zonal gate closure	contradiction to some of the
the intraday cross-zonal gate closure		time determined in accordance with []	arrangements being developed under
time determined in accordance with	2. Market operators shall provide	the capacity allocation and congestion	the Electricity Balancing Guideline (EB
Article 59 of Regulation (EU)	market participants with the	management guideline adopted on the	GL), which came into force only 5
2015/1222.	opportunity to trade in energy in	basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU)	months ago. The 15-minute gate closure
	national and cross- border markets in	714/2009.	text cuts across the proposal for the
2. Market operators shall provide	time intervals at least as short as the		intraday cross-zonal gate closure time,
market participants with the	imbalance settlement period in both	2. Nominated electricity market	which has recently been set at one hour
opportunity to trade in energy in time	day-ahead and intraday markets.	operators shall provide market	before the start of each market time unit
intervals at least as short as the		participants with the opportunity to	on most bidding zone borders by ACER
imbalance settlement period in both	3. Market operators shall provide	trade in energy in time intervals at least	following a proposal of the TSOs to the
day-ahead and intraday markets.	products for trading in day-ahead and	as short as the imbalance settlement	detriment of NEMOs.
	intraday markets which are sufficiently	period in both day-ahead and intraday	
3. Market operators shall provide	small in size, with minimum bid sizes of	markets in accordance with [] the	The Commission's text allows for a
products for trading in day-ahead and	500 Kilowatt, to allow for the effective	balancing guideline adopted on the	gradual evolution of the intraday cross-
intraday markets which are sufficiently	participation of demand-side response,	basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU)	zonal gate closure time (IDCZGCT)
small in size, with minimum bid sizes of	energy storage and small-scale	714/2009.	depending on the reality of the
1 Megawatt or less, to allow for the	renewables including directly by		market. Such an evolution may have an
effective participation of demand-side	customers.	3. Nominated electricity market	impact on the European balancing
response, energy storage and small-		operators shall provide products for	platform for replacement reserve which
scale renewables.	4. By 1 January 2021 , the imbalance	trading in day-ahead and intraday	is currently under development.
	settlement period shall be 15 minutes	markets which are sufficiently small in	
	in all control areas.	size, with minimum bid sizes of 1	Art. 7(3): Market operators shall
		Megawatt [], to allow for the effective	provide products for trading in day-



4. By 1 January 2025, the imbalance participation of demand-side response, settlement period shall be 15 minutes energy storage and small-scale in all control areas. renewables in accordance to the methodologies developed in the [] capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009. 4. [] By 1 January 2021, the imbalance settlement period shall be 15 minutes in all [] scheduling areas unless [] regulatory authorities have granted a derogation or an exemption in accordance with [] the balancing guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009. [] Art. 7(4): As Council. European

ahead and intraday markets which are sufficiently small in size, with minimum bid sizes of 1 Megawatt or less, to allow for the effective participation of demand-side response, energy storage and small-scale renewables.

Justification: There is no reason to stipulate minimum or, for that matter. maximum size of bids in day-ahead or intraday markets in the regulation. Currently at least ranges between 0.1 and 1.0 MWh/h are used. The minimum limits used should be freely adaptable based on the evolution of the markets, while respecting any technical limits that may apply to handle the price formation.

Justification: Both the proposal made by Commission and Parliament's amendments are in contradiction to other legislation currently in force, particularly Art. 53 (1) and Art. 62 (1) of the Electricity Balancing Guideline (EB GL). Keeping different provisions and subsequent deadlines in two EU legislative acts legal inconsistency creates and confusion for the market.



7. Dispatching of generation and demand response: Art. 11

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Dispatching of generation and demand response (Art. 11) 1. Dispatching of power generation facilities and demand response shall be non-discriminatory and market based unless otherwise provided under paragraphs 2 to 4. 2. When dispatching electricity generating installations, transmission system operators shall give priority to generating installations using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration from small generating installations using emerging technologies to the following extent: (a) generating installations using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 500 kW; or (b) demonstration projects for innovative technologies.	2(a) generating installations using renewable energy sources or highefficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 500 kW; (b) generating installations which are demonstration projects for innovative technologies; Member States may apply higher limits to local energy communities as established in the Directive (EU) [recast of Directive 2009/72/EC as proposed by COM(2016) 864/2].	1.Dispatching of power generation facilities and demand response shall be non- discriminatory, transparent and, unless otherwise provided under Article 11 (2) to Article 11 (4), market based. [] 2.[] Without prejudice to [] Articles 107 to 109 TFEU Member States may provide for electricity generated [] using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration from small [] power generating facility or power generating facility using emerging technologies to be granted priority dispatch up to the following extent: (a) [] power generating facility using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than [] 250 kW; or (b) demonstration projects for emerging [] technologies as defined [] in the network code on requirements	Art. 11(2) (a) [] power generating facility using renewable energy sources or high efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than [] 250 kW; or— Justification: All technologies must compete fairly in the market, which includes market-based dispatching. A properly functioning intraday and balancing market, combined with market-based and non-discriminatory rules for curtailment effectively removes the need for priority dispatch. This approach is the most efficient and ensures the lowest cost to the consumer. As renewable generation rapidly grows and becomes increasingly cost-competitive, it is vital to ensure the cost-efficient market integration of renewables at this stage.



	for generators adopted on the basis of Article 6 of Regulation 714/2009.	
	D .	

8. Definition of bidding zones: Art. 13

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Definition of bidding zones (Art. 13) 1. Bidding zone borders shall be based on long-term, structural congestions in the transmission network and bidding zones shall not contain such congestions. The configuration of bidding zones in the Union shall be designed in such a way as to maximise economic efficiency and cross-border trading opportunities while maintaining security of supply. []	1. The configuration of bidding zones in the Union shall be designed in such a way as to ensure liquidity of day- ahead and intraday markets, and thus to maximise economic efficiency and cross- border trading opportunities while maintaining security of supply. Bidding zone borders shall be based on long-term, structural congestions in the transmission network and bidding zones shall not contain such congestions unless they have no impact on neighbouring bidding zones, or their impact is mitigated by remedial actions. []	Measures to address congestion and definition of bidding zones (Art. 13) 1. Member States shall take all appropriate measures to [] address congestions. Bidding zone borders shall be based on long-term, structural congestions in the transmission network []. Bidding zones shall not contain such structural congestions unless they have no impact, or their impact on neighbouring bidding zones is mitigated through the use of remedial actions and they do not lead to reductions of cross zonal trading capacity. The configuration of the bidding zones in the Union shall be designed in such a way as to maximise economic efficiency and in order to maximise cross-border trading	Art. 13: Any bidding zone configuration needs to take into account existing long-term structural congestion. However, it is also imperative to consider the impacts of any changes on the stability of markets. It is also key to consider not only splitting of bidding zones but also mergers where they are justified. Europex welcomes the Council's position to take all appropriate measures to address congestions, to avoid reductions of cross-zonal trading capacity and to maximise cross-border trading opportunities. Maximising cross-zonal trading capacity available to the market is of vital importance. When it comes to bidding zones configuration, predictability is crucial for trading confidence. For more



	opportunities, [] with due respect to the provisions in Article 14.	details about how this is ensured, see Europex' position on Article 14 below.
	[]	Europex welcomes the Parliament's recognition of the need for a reliable market environment when assessing current bidding zones.

9. General principles of capacity allocation and congestion management: Art. 14

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
General principles of capacity allocation and congestion management (Art. 14) 3. The maximum capacity of the interconnections and/or the transmission networks affecting cross-border flows shall be made available to market participants, complying with safety standards of secure network operation. Counter-trading and redispatch, including cross-border redispatch, shall be used to maximise available capacities unless it is demonstrated that it is not beneficial to economic efficiency at Union level.	interconnections and/or the transmission networks affecting cross-border flows shall be made available to market participants, complying with safety standards of secure network operation. Counter-trading and redispatch, including cross-border	3. Unless otherwise provided in paragraphs 7, 7a, 7b, 7d and [], 2a the maximum level of capacity of the interconnections and/or the transmission networks affected by cross-border [] capacity shall be made available to market participants, complying with safety standards of secure network operation. [] Countertrading and redispatch, including cross-border redispatch, shall be used to optimize available capacities [] and a coordinated and non-discriminatory process for cross-border remedial actions shall be applied to enable this, following the implementation of the redispatching and countertrading cost	Art. 14(3): Europex supports the principle stated in Article 16(3) of Regulation 714/2009 and confirmed by the Commission in Article 14(3) of the proposal which calls for 'The maximum capacity of the interconnections and/or the transmission networks affecting cross-border flows shall be made available to market participants, complying with safety standards of secure network operation. Countertrading and redispatch, including cross-border redispatch, shall be used to maximise available capacities unless it is demonstrated that it is not beneficial to economic efficiency at Union level'



7. Transmission system operators shall not limit the volume of interconnection capacity to be made available to other market participants in order to solve congestion inside their own control area or as a means of managing flows on a border between two control areas observed even without any transaction, that is to say flows over control areas caused by origin and destination within one control area.

Upon request by a transmission system operator, the relevant regulatory authority may grant a derogation from the first subparagraph where it is necessary for maintaining operational security or where it is beneficial to economic efficiency at Union level. Such a derogation, which may not relate to curtailment of already allocated capacities pursuant to paragraph 5, shall be limited in time, strictly limited to what is necessary, and avoid discrimination between internal and cross-zonal exchanges. Before granting a derogation, the relevant regulatory authority shall consult the regulatory authorities of other Member States forming part of an affected capacity calculation region. In case a regulatory authority disagrees with the proposed derogation, the Agency shall decide on the derogation pursuant to Article 6(8)(a) [recast of Regulation (EC) No 713/2009 as proposed by COM(2016)

and re- entering a bidding zone contribute to the congestion observed between two bidding zones and allocate the counter-trading and redispatch costs in proportion to their contribution to the congestion.

7. Transmission system operators shall not limit the volume of interconnection capacity to be made available to other market participants in order to solve congestion inside their own control area or as a means of managing flows on a border between two control areas observed even without any transaction, that is to say flows over control areas caused by origin and destination within one control area.

Without prejudice to the forth subparagraph of Article 13(5), this paragraph shall be considered to be complied with if the following minimum levels of available capacity for cross-zonal trade, which is calculated pursuant to the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009 taking account of contingencies, are reached:

(i) for borders using a coordinated net transfer capacity approach, if at least 75 % of the net transfer capacity pursuant to capacity allocation and congestion sharing methodology in accordance with [] the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009 [].

7. Transmission system operators [] shall not limit the volume of interconnection capacity to be made available to [] market participants in order to solve congestion inside their own bidding zone [] or as a means of managing flows leaving and re-entering the same bidding zone without being scheduled unless otherwise provided under paragraph 7a or 7b.

Without prejudice to the application of the derogations under paragraph 7a and 7b, this paragraph shall be considered to be complied with if the following minimum levels of available capacity for cross-zonal trade, which is calculated pursuant to the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009 taking account of N-1 criterion, are reached:

(i) For borders using a coordinated net transmission capacity approach, 75% of the net transfer capacity pursuant to capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the It is crucial to have continuous transparency on the underlying reasons and justifications for any cross zonal capacity restrictions linked to the competitive markets, e.g. forward, dayahead and intraday.



863/2]. The justification and reasons for the derogation shall be published. Where a derogation is granted, the relevant transmission system operators shall develop and publish a methodology and projects that shall provide a long-term solution to the issue that the derogation seeks to address. The derogation shall expire when the time limit is reached or, once the solution is applied, whichever is earlier.

management guideline are made available for cross-border trade;

(ii) for borders using a flow-based approach, if on cross-zonal and internal critical network elements considered in the flow-based calculation at least 75 % of the thermal capacity after reduction of the amount required to secure the N-1 principle pursuant to the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline is used as an input for capacity allocation.

basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009;

(ii) For borders using a flow-based approach, 75% of the remaining available margin on internal and cross border critical network elements made available for cross border flows pursuant to capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009.

The derogations pursuant to paragraph 7a shall not result with a value below this threshold.

7a. [] Based on a proposal by all transmission system operators of a capacity calculation region , the relevant [] regulatory authorities by way of derogation from paragraph 7 [] shall approve [] the level of [] total available cross-zonal capacity at each bidding zone border, [] which shall be used in the capacity calculation methodology, to take account of cross-zonal unscheduled flows to the extent that could be expected [] without structural congestions in a bidding zone. []

(Part of 7, moved as 7b below)

7b. Upon request by [] transmission system operators of a capacity



•		
	alculation region [] the relevant	
-	egulatory authorities may grant a	
	erogation from [] paragraph 7 for	
for	preseeable reasons [] where it is	
ne	ecessary for maintaining operational	
sec	ecurity other than the ones covered	
un	nder paragraph 7a, for instance in	
	ase of grid maintenance measures. []	
Su	uch a derogation, which may not	
rel	elate to curtailment of already	
allo	llocated capacities pursuant to	
pa	aragraph 5, shall be limited [] to one	
yea	ear at a time, or up to maximum []	
	wo years with a significantly	
	ecreasing level of the derogation each	
yea	ear, strictly limited to what is	
ne	ecessary, and avoid discrimination	
be	etween internal and cross-zonal	
exc	xchanges. [] The justification and	
rea	easons for the derogation shall be	
pu	ublished. Where a derogation is	
gra	ranted, the relevant transmission	
sys	ystem operators shall develop and	
pu	ublish a methodology and projects []	
tha	nat shall provide a long-term solution	
	the issue that the derogation seeks	
	address. The derogation shall expire	
wh	hen the time limit is reached or, once	
the	ne solution is applied, whichever is	
eal	arlier.	



10. Capacity remuneration mechanisms: Arts. 23 and 24

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017)	Europex position
23 Feb 2017		Document: 15879/17	
Capacity remuneration mechanisms (Art. 23) 3. Capacity mechanisms shall not create unnecessary market distortions and not limit cross-border trade. The amount of capacity committed in the mechanism shall not go beyond what is necessary to address the concern. 4. Generation capacity for which a final investment decision has been made after [OP: entry into force] shall only be eligible to participate in a capacity mechanism if its emissions are below 550 gr CO2/kWh. Generation capacity emitting 550 gr CO2/kWh or more shall not be committed in capacity mechanisms 5 years after the entry into force of this Regulation. 5. Where the European resource adequacy assessment has not identified a resource adequacy concern, Member States shall not apply capacity mechanisms.	Any capacity mechanism shall: (a) not create undue market distortions and not limit cross-border trade; (b) not go beyond what is necessary to address the adequacy concern; (c) select capacity providers by means of a transparent, non-discriminatory and market-based process; (d) be technology neutral; (e) provide incentives for capacity providers to be available in times of expected system stress; (f) ensure that the remuneration is determined through a market-based process; (g) set out the required technical conditions for the participation of capacity providers in advance of the selection process; (h) be open to participation of all resources, including storage and demand side management that are capable of providing the required technical performance;	2a. When a capacity mechanism is designed as a strategic reserve, resources in the strategic reserve shall only be dispatched in case transmission system operators [] are likely to exhaust[] their balancing resources to establish an equilibrium between demand and supply []. This requirement is without prejudice to activating resources ahead of actual dispatch in order to respect their ramping constraints and operating requirements. During periods where resources in the strategic reserve were dispatched imbalances in the market shall be settled at least at the bidding limit pursuant to Article 9 []. The [] resources taking part in the strategic reserve shall not get remunerated through [] wholesale electricity markets or balancing markets. 3. Capacity mechanisms shall: (a) not create unnecessary market distortions and not limit cross [] zonal	Art. 23: A properly functioning energy market minimises the need for capacity remuneration mechanisms, and maximises welfare for the European consumer. Capacity mechanisms should be implemented only as a last resort, and only after both a national and regional and preferably also a European adequacy assessment have been carried out, clearly demonstrating a need which cannot be met in any other secure way. The approach taken by the Parliament in Article 18a 'General principles for capacity mechanisms' is in line with this — i.e. to <i>not</i> introduce a capacity mechanism where the adequacy concern has not identified a need, or where the detailed implementation plan to address adequacy concerns as required under Article 18(3) has not received a positive decision from the Commission.
		trade; b) be market-based;	Europex welcomes the additional actions proposed by the Parliament in



- (i) apply appropriate penalties to capacity providers when not available in the event of system stress;
- (j) ensure that capacity contracts for existing installations are rewarded for a maximum length of 1 year.
- 2. Capacity mechanisms in the form of strategic reserves shall:
- (a) be held outside the market;
- (b) be dispatched only where dayahead and intraday markets have failed to clear and transmission system operators have exhausted their balancing resources to establish an equilibrium between demand and supply;
- (c) ensure that during periods where strategic reserves were dispatched, imbalances are settled at the technical price limit applied by the market operators pursuant to Article 9 or at the value of lost load, whichever the higher.
- (d) be limited to maximum emissions of 200kg/CO2/kW for the electricity production per year. The electricity generated, or the load reduction achieved by resources in the strategic reserve shall not be sold through wholesale electricity markets.

- (c) be open to participation of all resources that are capable of providing the required technical performance in a technology neutral manner and through fair and transparent rules, including but not limited to participation of storage, energy efficiency and demand response [];
- (d) be temporary, but are permitted, in accordance with state aid rules, as long as the relevant resource adequacy assessment identifies a resource adequacy concern;
- **(e)** [] not go beyond what is necessary to address the **resource adequacy** concern.

[]

- 4. [] In the design of a capacity mechanism, Member States shall apply the following requirements regarding CO2 emission limits:
- (a) Generation capacity emitting more than 550 gr CO2/kWh of energy or more than 700 kg CO2 on average per year per installed kW for which a final investment decision has been made after [OP: date of entry into force] shall not receive payments or commitments for future payments under a capacity mechanism as of 31 December 2025.

Article 18(3) to address adequacy concerns, and considers these as necessary conditions for properly functioning markets.

The proposed detailing of limits on strategic reserves in the Parliament's proposal has flaws which we would like to be re-considered as follows:

- There should not be additional limitations placed on strategic reserves versus how other capacity mechanisms may be applied.
- Thus, as an example: While we agree that capacity mechanisms should not interfere with the ordinary free markets, there should be an allowance for activation of Strategic Reserves as a last resort measure linked to the organized markets after all ordinary orders have been utilised, e.g. at the maximum (harmonised) clearing price limit in the markets. The reason being, among others, that a significant share of the production and consumption reserves are of the type that require a reasonable lead time (X hours) before activation to manage efficiently from economic and system security perspective.



	3. In addition to the requirements laid down in paragraph 1, capacity mechanisms other than strategic reserves shall: (a) be constructed so as to ensure that the price paid for availability automatically tends to zero when the level of capacity supplied is expected to be adequate to meet the level of capacity demanded; (b) remunerate the participating resources merely for their availability and ensure that the remuneration does not affect decisions of the capacity provider whether or not to generate; (c) ensure that capacity obligations are transferable between eligible capacity providers.	(b) Generation capacity emitting more than 550 gr CO2/kWh of energy or more than 700 kg CO2 on average per year per installed kW for which a final investment decision has been made before [OP: date of entry into force] shall not receive payments or commitments for future payments under a capacity mechanism as of 31 December 2030, except for contracts with a remaining duration of not more than 5 years concluded before 31 December 2030. Between 31 December 2030. Between 31 December 2025 and 31 December 2030, the capacity receiving remuneration for this participation should be reduced by 5% per year. (c) The emission limit of 550 gr CO2/kWh of energy and the limit of 700 kg CO2 on average per year per installed kW shall be calculated based on the design efficiency of the generation unit as provided by an accredited certification organisation.	Art. 23(4): We disagree with provisions for maximum emission limits for capacity mechanism resources. All market related arrangements should be technology neutral; thus, the functioning of the market clearing and power system balancing should not be subject to limits on which resources can be used, not least since there are costs placed on resources emitting CO2 and other pollutants via other mechanisms.
Art. 24 Existing mechanisms Member States applying capacity mechanisms on [OP: entry into force of this Regulation] shall adapt their mechanisms to comply with Articles 18, 21 and 23 of this Regulation.	Member States applying capacity mechanisms on [OP: entry into force of this Regulation] shall adapt their mechanisms to comply with Articles 18, 18a, 21 and 23 of this Regulation.	Member States applying capacity mechanisms on [OP: entry into force of this Regulation] shall adapt their mechanisms to comply with Articles 18, 21 and 23 of this Regulation [] without prejudice to commitments or contracts, concluded before that date, and without prejudice to the Union State aid rules pursuant to Articles 107 to 109 TFEU, including state aid	In order to avoid regulatory uncertainty, and to ensure legal security and predictability, this provision should only apply to mechanisms which have not already been approved by the Commission under the Energy and Environment State Aid Guidelines.



	decisions taken thereafter before that	
	date.	



<u>Draft recast of the Electricity Directive</u>

11. Market based supply prices: Art. 5

Commission proposal COM(2016) 864 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) 15886/17	Europex position
Market based supply prices (Art. 5) 3. By way of derogation from paragraphs 1 and 2, Member States which apply public interventions in price setting for the supply of electricity for energy poor or vulnerable household customers at the [OP: please insert the date of entry into force of this Directive] may continue to apply such public interventions until [OP: insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this Directive]. Such public interventions shall pursue a general economic interest, be clearly defined, transparent, non-discriminatory, verifiable and guarantee equal access for Union electricity companies to customers. The interventions shall not go beyond what is necessary to achieve the general economic interest which they pursue, be limited in time and proportionate as regards their beneficiaries.	 4. Between [OP – insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this Directive] and [OP – insert the date – ten years from the entry into force of this Directive], Member States may still apply public interventions in the pricesetting for the supply of electricity for vulnerable household customers. Such interventions shall comply with all the following conditions: (a) they shall not go beyond what is necessary to achieve the general economic interest which they pursue; (b) they shall be limited in time; (c) they shall be proportionate as regards their beneficiaries; (d) they shall be limited to energy poor and vulnerable customers; 	3. By way of derogation from paragraphs 1 and 2, Member States [] may apply public interventions in price setting for the supply of electricity subject to the conditions in paragraphs 3 and 3b []. 3a. [] Public interventions pursuant to paragraph 3 shall: (a) pursue a general economic interest; (b) be clearly defined, transparent, non-discriminatory and verifiable []; (c) guarantee equal access for Union electricity companies to customers. The interventions shall not go beyond what is necessary to achieve the general economic interest which they pursue, (d) be limited in time and proportionate as regards their beneficiaries.	Art. 5(4): After[OP — insert the date — five years from the entry into force of this Directive], Member States may still apply public interventions in the price setting for the supply of electricity for vulnerable household customers in so far as it is strictly necessary for reasons of extreme urgency. Such interventions shall comply with the conditions set out in paragraph 3. [] Justification: Regulated electricity supply (retail) prices prevent fair competition, hamper new market entrants, discourage innovation and ultimately prevent consumers from getting the best deal. The possibility of intervening in (end user) price setting in the draft recast of the Electricity Directive should be categorically excluded and existing



4. After[OP – insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this Directive], Member States may still apply public interventions in the pricesetting for the supply of electricity for vulnerable household customers in so far as it is strictly necessary for reasons of extreme urgency. Such interventions shall comply with the conditions set out in paragraph 3.

Member States shall notify the measures taken in accordance with the first subparagraph to the Commission within one month after adoption and may apply them immediately. The notification shall be accompanied by an explanation why other instruments could not sufficiently address the situation and how the beneficiaries and the duration of the measure have been determined. The notification shall be considered as complete if, within two months from its receipt, or from the receipt of any additional information requested, the Commission does not request any further information.

The Commission may take a decision asking the national authorities to amend or withdraw the measures within two months from receipt of a complete notification where it considers that the requirements set out in the first subparagraph are not

- (e) they shall not impede market entry by new participants;
- (f) they shall not negatively impact the wholesale electricity market;
- (g) they shall not result in additional costs for market participants in a discriminatory way; and
- (h) all beneficiaries of such public intervention shall have the possibility to choose competitive market offers and shall be directly informed of the availability of offers and savings on the competitive market, in particular dynamic electricity price contracts, at least every quarter and they shall be provided with assistance to switch to a market based offer.

- 3b. Public interventions pursuant to paragraph 3 shall:
- (-a) avoid influencing the wholesale electricity market;
- (a) not result in additional costs for market participants in a discriminatory way;
- (b) not lead to direct crosssubsidisation between customers supplied at free market prices and those supplied at regulated supply prices;
- (c) ensure that all beneficiaries of such public intervention have the possibility to choose competitive market offers and are directly informed of the availability of offers and savings on the competitive market, in particular dynamic electricity price contracts, at least every quarter and that they are provided with assistance to switch to a market based offer;
- (d) ensure that, pursuant to Article 19 and 21, all beneficiaries of such public interventions are entitled to and are offered to have smart meters being installed at no extra costs for these customers and are directly informed of the possibility to install smart meters

interventions should urgently be phased out.

The Council's proposal of introducing unspecified wholesale market price setting safeguards is insufficient and potentially misleading.



fulfilled. The decision-making period	and are provided with necessary	
can be extended with the consent of	assistance.	
both the Commission and the Member		
State concerned.	[]	
The public intervention applied on the basis of this paragraph shall be deemed valid as long as the Commission has not taken a decision asking the national authorities to amend or withdraw the measure.		

12. Tasks of distribution system operators in the use of flexibility: Art. 32(1) para 2

Commission proposal COM(2016) 864 final/2 published	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017)	Europex position
23 Feb 2017		15886/17	
Tasks of distribution system operators	Standardised market products for such services shall be defined at least at the	1a. Distribution system operators	Art. 32(1): As Council.
in the use of flexibility - Art. 32(1) para 2	national level. Distribution system	subject to an oversight by the regulatory authority, or the regulatory	Justification: Competition among all
Distribution system operators shall	operators shall, in a transparent and participatory process that includes all	authority itself, shall define [] the specifications for the flexibility services	types of resources and easy market- access driven by market-based solutions
define standardised market products for the services procured ensuring	relevant system users, the national regulatory authority and the	procured in close cooperation with the transmission system operators. The	are the most efficient way to enable and deliver flexibility.
effective participation of all market participants including renewable energy	transmission system operator, define standardised market products for the	specifications shall ensure an [] effective and non-discriminatory	The integration and optimal use of
sources, demand response, and aggregators. Distribution system	services procured ensuring effective participation of all market participants	participation of all market participants including renewable energy sources,	flexibility will be a key ingredient of the future power market. Reliable wholesale
operators shall exchange all necessary information and coordinate with	including renewable energy sources, demand response, storage and	demand response, energy storage facilities and []market participants	price signals exhibit an efficient signal to steer activity.



transmission system operators in order to ensure the optimal utilisation of resources, ensure the secure and efficient operation of the system and facilitate market development.

Distribution system operators shall be adequately remunerated for the procurement of such services in order to recover at least the corresponding expenses, including the necessary information and communication technologies expenses, including expenses which correspond to the necessary information and communication infrastructure.

aggregators. Distribution system operators shall exchange all necessary information and coordinate with transmission system operators in order to ensure the optimal utilisation of resources, ensure the secure and efficient operation of the system and facilitate market development. Distribution system operators shall be adequately remunerated for the procurement of such services in order to recover at least the corresponding expenses, including the necessary information and communication technologies expenses, including expenses which correspond to the necessary information and communication infrastructure.

engaged in aggregation. Distribution system operators shall exchange all necessary information and coordinate with transmission system operators in order to ensure the optimal utilisation of resources, ensure the secure and efficient operation of the system and facilitate market development. Distribution system operators shall be adequately remunerated for the procurement of such services in order to recover at least the corresponding reasonable costs [], including the necessary information and communication technologies expenses and [] infrastructure costs.

As well as non-discriminatory market participation, it will be important to address the following market design aspects:

- Clear definition of roles and responsibilities;
- Efficient, transparent and open market venues;
- Where suitable and over time seek to establish product standardisation, which can increase liquidity on the market;
- Addressing counter party default risk mitigation (clearing).
- Interaction with organized markets and Ancillary Services on Wholesale and "TSO" level.

13. Tasks of transmission system operators: Art. 40 (4) and (5)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 864 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) 15886/17	Europex position
Tasks of transmission system operators – Art. 40 4. In performing the task described in point (i) of paragraph 1, the	5a. Member States shall provide the necessary regulatory framework to allow and incentivise transmission system operators to procure services in order to improve efficiencies in the	4. In performing the task described in point (i) of paragraph 1, the transmission system operators shall []	Art. 40: See position on Art 32(1)



transmission system operator shall ensure that the procurement of balancing services and, unless justified by a cost-benefit analysis, nonfrequency ancillary services, is:

- (a) transparent, non-discriminatory and market-based;
- (b) ensures effective participation of all market participants including renewable energy sources, demand response, energy storage facilities and aggregators, in particular by requiring regulatory authorities or transmission system operators in close cooperation with all market participants, to define technical modalities for participation in these markets on the basis of the technical requirements of these markets and the capabilities of all market participants.
- 5. Transmission system operators shall not own assets that provide ancillary services save under the conditions set out in Article 54.

operation and development of the transmission system, including local congestion management. In particular, regulatory frameworks shall ensure that transmission system operators can procure services from resources such as demand response or storage and consider energy efficiency measures, when such services costeffectively supplant the need to upgrade or replace electricity capacity and which support the efficient and secure operation of the transmission system. Transmission system operators shall procure those services in accordance with transparent, nondiscriminatory and market based procedures.

[...]

procure balancing services [] according
to:

- (a) transparent, non-discriminatory and market-based **procedures**;
- (b) ensures effective participation of all qualified electricity undertakings and market participants including renewable energy sources, demand response, energy storage facilities and [] market participants engaged in aggregation. For that purpose, [] regulatory authorities [] and transmission system operators shall, in close cooperation with all market participants, [] define technical modalities for participation in these markets on the basis of the technical requirements of these markets in accordance with the Commission Regulation 2017/1485 establishing a guideline on electricity transmission system operation [].

5. []

5a. The requirements of paragraph 4 shall apply to the provision of those non-frequency ancillary services by transmission system operators, unless the regulatory authority has assessed that the market-based provision of non-frequency ancillary services is



economically no granted a derog	ot efficient and has gation.
frequency ancil	ion to procure non- lary services does not tegrated network

About

Europex is a not-for-profit association of European energy exchanges with 26 members. It represents the interests of exchange-based wholesale electricity, gas and environmental markets, focuses on developments of the European regulatory framework for wholesale energy trading and provides a discussion platform at European level.

Contact

Europex – Association of European Energy Exchanges Address: Rue Archimède 44, 1000 Brussels, Belgium

Phone: +32 2 512 34 10
Website: www.europex.org
Email: secretariat@europex.org

Twitter: Europex_energy