

Europex positions ahead of the electricity market design trilogue negotiations

Four column table – Electricity Regulation and Directive

Brussels, 18 June 2018

D	raft	t recast of the Electricity Regulation	3
	1.	Delegated operators: Recital 7a; Art. 2(2)ff; Art. 3(1); Art. 5(10)	3
	2.	The role of long-term markets: Art. 3(1)	
	3.	Balancing responsibility: Art. 4	6
	4.	Balancing market: Art. 5	
	5.	Day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 6(3)	10
	6.	Trade on day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 7(1)	
	7.	Dispatching of generation and demand response: Art. 11	
	8.	Definition of bidding zones: Art. 13	14
	9.	General principles of capacity allocation and congestion management: Art. 14	15
	10.	Capacity remuneration mechanisms: Arts. 23 and 24	19
D	raft	t recast of the Electricity Directive	.23
	11.	Market based supply prices: Art. 5	23
	12.	Tasks of distribution system operators in the use of flexibility: Art. 32(1) para 2	25
	13.	Tasks of transmission system operators: Art. 40 (4) and (5)	26



Draft recast of the Electricity Regulation

1. Delegated operators: Recital 7a; Art. 2(2)ff; Art. 3(1); Art. 5(10)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
 Art. 3(1) 1. Member States, national regulatory authorities, transmission system operators, distribution system operators, and market operators shall ensure that electricity markets are operated in accordance with the following principles: Art. 5(10) 10. Transmission system operators shall publish close to real-time information on the current balancing state of their control areas, the imbalance price and the balancing energy price. 	 Art. 3(1) 1. Member States, national regulatory authorities, transmission system operators, distribution system operators, market operators and third parties to whom responsibilities have been delegated or assigned, shall ensure that electricity markets are operated in accordance with the following principles: Art. 5(10) 10. Transmission system operators or third parties to whom these responsibilities have been delegated by the relevant transmission system operator, Member State or regulatory authority shall publish close to real- time information on the current balancing state of their control areas, the estimated imbalance price and the estimated balancing energy price. 	Recital 7a The Balancing Guideline establishes in its Article 13 a process where transmission system operators are able to delegate all or part of their tasks to a third party. The delegating transmission system operators should remain responsible for ensuring compliance with the obligations in this Regulation. Likewise, Member States should be able to assign tasks and obligations to a third party. Such assignment should be limited to tasks and obligations executed at national level (such as imbalance settlement). The limitations to the assignment should not lead to unnecessary changes to the existing national arrangements. However, transmission system operators should remain responsible for the tasks entrusted to them pursuant to Article 40 of the [recast Electricity Directive].	 Recital 7a; Art. 2(2)ff; Art. 3(1); Art. 5(10): As Council. Justification: 'Delegated operators' are non-TSO third parties who have been assigned or delegated essential tasks related to the balancing market by a Member State or a Transmission System Operator (TSO). This includes, for example, imbalance settlement and calculation or data publication. It is important that the European Parliament now aligns with the Council's position to ensure clarity around these existing arrangements. These delegated operators have already been recognised in the Network Code on Emergency and Restoration (NC ER) and the Electricity Balancing Guideline (EB GL) as 'third parties'. Europex published



A+ 2/2)#	a nanar in November 2017 evolutions
Art 2(2)ff	a paper in November 2017 explaining
	these arrangements in more detail. ¹
'delegated operator' means an entity	
to whom specific tasks or obligations	
entrusted to a transmission system	
operator or nominated electricity	
market operator under this Regulation	
or any other Regulation, Directive,	
Network Code or Guideline have been	
delegated by that transmission system	
operator or nominated electricity	
market operator or have been assigned	
by a Member State or [] Regulatory	
Authority;	
Art 3(1)	
Member States, national regulatory	
authorities, transmission system	
operators, distribution system	
operators, [] market operators and	
delegated operators shall ensure that	
electricity markets are operated in	
accordance with the following	
principles:	
Art 5(10)	
Transmission system operators shall	
publish, as soon as possible but not	
later than 30 minutes after [] real-	
time, the information on the current	
system balance [] of their []	
scheduling areas and the estimated []	

¹ https://www.europex.org/position-papers/the-essential-tasks-of-third-party-market-operators-in-the-electricity-market/



balancing energy prices. To the extent that responsibility for provision of this information has been assigned or delegated to a third party, in accordance with [] the Balancing Guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009Article, those parties will be responsible for meeting the requirements of this Article.

2. The role of long-term markets: Art. 3(1)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Principles regarding the operation of electricity markets - Art. 3(1) (n) long-term hedging opportunities, which allow market participants to hedge against price volatility risks on a market basis, and eliminate uncertainty on future returns on investment shall be tradable on exchanges in a transparent manner subject to compliance with EU treaty rules on competition.	(n) long-term hedging opportunities, which allow market participants to hedge against price volatility risks on a market basis, and mitigate uncertainty on future returns on investment shall be tradable on exchanges in a transparent manner subject to compliance with EU treaty rules on competition while current products offered on exchanges should be further expanded and promoted at Union level; Regulatory changes shall take into account effects on both short-term and long-term forward and	 (n) in order to [] allow market participants to be protected [] against price volatility risks on a market basis, and [] mitigate uncertainty on future returns on investment, long-term hedging opportunities shall be tradable on exchanges in a transparent manner and long- term supply contracts shall be negotiable over the counter, subject to compliance with EU treaty rules on competition. 	Art. 3(1): As Parliament. Justification: Europex welcomes the Parliament's recognition that any regulatory changes must take into account effects on both short-term and long-term forward and futures markets and products. The importance of long- term markets and products should be reflected in the final text. The Council's General Approach includes a mention of over the counter (OTC) long-term hedging opportunities.
	futures markets and products.		Europex believes that the choice of



	instruments for long-term hedgi should be left up to market participan and there is no need to specify the n of instruments in this Regulation.	s,

3. Balancing responsibility: Art. 4

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
 Balancing responsibility (Art. 4) 1. All market participants shall aim for system balance and shall be financially responsible for imbalances they cause in the system. They shall either be balance responsible parties or delegate their responsibility to a balance responsible party of their choice. 2. Member States may provide for derogation from balance responsibility in respect of: (a) demonstration projects; (b) generating installations using renewable energy sources or high- 	2a. When a Member State chooses to provide a derogation in accordance with Article 4(2), it shall ensure that the financial responsibilities for imbalances are fulfilled by another party.	Balance[] responsibility (Art. 4) All market participants [] shall be [] responsible for the imbalances they cause in the system []. To that end, the market participants [] shall either be balance responsible parties or contractually delegate their responsibility to a balance responsible party of their choice. In accordance with the Balancing Guideline adopted on the basis of Article 17 and 18 of the Regulation 714/2009, each balance responsible party shall be financially responsible for its imbalances and strive to be balanced or help the power system to be balanced. Member States may provide [] derogations from [] balancing	 Art. 4(2): Member States may provide [] derogations from [] balancing responsibility only in the following cases: (b) power generating facility, using renewable energy sources or high- efficiency cogeneration with a total installed electricity capacity of less than [] 250 kW; Justification: The most efficient way to achieve emissions reduction and an overall increase in welfare is through technology neutral market rules. Well- functioning spot, long-term and balancing markets, which properly reflect the market value of power, provide the necessary price signals to drive optimal technology choices and investment.



efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 500 kW; (c) installations benefitting from support	responsibility only in the following cases: (a) demonstration projects for	It is vital that all m financially respon they cause. Derog
approved by the Commission under Union State aid rules pursuant to Articles 107 to 109 TFEU, and commissioned prior to [OP: entry into force]. Member States may, subject to Union state aid	emerging technologies as defined in Article 66 and 67 of Regulation (EU) 2016/63112;	distortions and r costs ultimately bo Renewable prod
rules, incentivize market participants which are fully or partly exempted from balancing responsibility to accept full balancing responsibility against	(b) power generating facility, using renewable energy sources or high- efficiency cogeneration with a total installed electricity capacity of less than [] 250 kW;	third-party provid order to fulfil the o
appropriate compensation. 3. From 1 January 2026, point (b) of	(c) Without prejudice to contracts concluded before [entry into force of	generation has b and over time has cost-competitive
paragraph 2 shall apply only to generating installations using renewable energy sources or high- efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 250 kW.	the legislation], and installations benefitting from support approved by the Commission under Union State aid rules pursuant to Articles 107 to 109 TFEU, and commissioned prior to [OP: entry into force]. Member States may, [] without prejudice to Articles 107 and	already today. increasingly import the share of rener grow even further thermal power plat to gradually be plat
	108 TFEU , incentivise market participants which are fully or partly exempted from balancing responsibility to accept full balancing responsibility. []	from imbalance potentially massiv impact the system
	2a. When a Member State chooses to provide a derogation according to Article 4 (2), they need to ensure that the financial responsibilities of imbalances are fulfilled by another party.	by system operato explicit preventive limit such impact.
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		

is vital that all market participants are nancially responsible for imbalances ley cause. Derogations for renewable roducers are inefficient market stortions and may generate excess osts ultimately borne by the consumer. enewable producers can normally elegate their balance responsibility to a nird-party provider of their choice in rder to fulfil the obligation.

As very-low marginal cost renewable generation has been growing rapidly, and over time has become increasingly cost-competitive, this principle on balance responsibility is important already today. It will become increasingly important in the future as the share of renewable production will grow even further while conventional thermal power plants can be expected to gradually be phased out.

If some RES generators are exempted from imbalance responsibility, a potentially massive deployment could impact the system operation and the market in such a way that could actually incentivise a discriminatory treatment by system operators through implicit or explicit preventive measures aimed to limit such impact.



3. For power generating facilitie	;
commissioned after 1 January 2026	
point (b) of paragraph 2 shall apply only	,
to renewable energy sources or high	
efficiency cogeneration with an tota	
installed electricity capacity of less that	
[] 150 kW. Member States may apply a	
lower threshold.	

4. Balancing market: Art. 5

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Art. 5 Balancing market		[]	Art. 5(2): As Council.
2. Balancing markets shall be organised in such a way as to ensure effective non-discrimination between market participants taking account of the different technical capability of generation from variable renewable sources and demand side response and storage.	2. Balancing markets shall be organised in such a way as to ensure effective non-discrimination between market participants. All generation, including from variable renewable sources, demand side response and storage shall be enabled to participate on equal footing in balancing markets, taking account of the different technical	 2. Balancing markets, including prequalification processes, shall be organised in such a way as to: (a) ensure effective non-discrimination between market participants taking account of the different technical needs of the power system, a transparent and technologically neutral definition 	Justification: With respect to balancing markets, Europex supports the principles of transparent and technologically neutral definition of services and market-based procurement. Art. 5(8): As Council.
8. The procurement of balancing capacity shall be facilitated on a	capability.	of services and their transparent, market based procurement [],	Justification: The allocation of cross- zonal capacity for the exchange of
regional level in accordance with point 8 of Annex I. The procurement shall be	8. The procurement of balancing capacity shall be performed by the		balancing capacity is already addressed in the Electricity Balancing Guideline
based on a primary market and organised in such a way as to be non-	transmission system operators. The procurement shall be based on a		(Chapter 2 of Title IV), which provides TSOs with a number of options. Setting a



		(h) ensure eccess to all ensure lified	$r_{\rm constants}$ limit on in Art $\Gamma(0)$ on
discriminatory between market	primary market and organised in such a	(b) ensure access to all prequalified	percentage limit as in Art. 5(8) as
participants in the prequalification	way as to be non-discriminatory	market participants, be it individual or	amended by the Parliament) would cut
process individually or through	between market participants in the	through aggregation;	across these provisions in the EB GL,
aggregation.	prequalification process, whether		which entered into force in December
	market participants participate	(c) respect the need to accommodate	2017.
10. Transmission system operators shall	individually or through aggregation	increasing shares of variable	
publish close to real-time information	subject to technical constraints	generation as well as increased	Any pre-allocation of cross-zonal
on the current balancing state of their	inherent in managing networks. The	demand responsiveness and the	capacity should be subject to strict
control areas, the imbalance price and	reservation of cross-zonal capacity for	advent of new technologies.	economic and operational justification,
the balancing energy price.	the exchange of balancing capacity		as well as transparency provisions if and
	shall be limited to 5% of the available	0	when applied, since it affects the price
	capacity for the exchange of energy of	0	formation in the intraday, day ahead and
	the previous relevant calendar year	8. The procurement of balancing	forward markets.
	between the respective bidding zones.		
		capacity shall be performed by the	Art. 5(10): The Electricity Balancing
	10. Transmission system operators or	transmission system operators, []	Guideline (EB GL) and the Transparency
	third parties to whom these	facilitated on a regional level [] in	Regulation ² already contain provisions
	responsibilities have been delegated	accordance with Balancing Guideline	on the publication of system balance
	by the relevant transmission system	adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the	information. The publication of
		Regulation 714/2009. The procurement	
	operator, Member State or regulatory	of balancing capacity shall be market-	imbalance prices and balancing energy
	authority shall publish close to real-	based [] and organised in such a way as	prices are also addressed by the
	time information on the current	to be non- discriminatory between	Transparency Regulation.
	balancing state of their control areas,	market participants in the	
	the estimated imbalance price and the	prequalification process individually or	Introducing new requirements in this
	estimated balancing energy price.	through aggregation in accordance with	Regulation, while different
		paragraph 4 of Article 40 of the [recast	requirements are already in force, would
	10a. Member States shall report on the	Electricity Directive]. []	lead to overlapping and potentially
	functioning and transparency of, and		incoherent legislation. This should be
	access to, in particular by small	10. Transmission system operators shall	avoided, and the wording of the existing
	providers, the balancing markets, in		legislation maintained.
	particular for the purpose of Article 4,	publish, as soon as possible but not	

² Commission Regulation (EU) of 14 June 2013 on submission and publication of data in electricity markets and amending Annex I to Regulation (EC) No 714/2009 of the European Parliament and of the Council.



through the reporting procedure on	later than 30 minutes after [] real-time,	
the internal energy market laid down	the information on the current system	
•.		
in Article 21 of Regulation/	balance [] of their [] scheduling areas	
[Governance of the Energy Union].	and the estimated [] balancing energy	
	prices. To the extent that responsibility	
	for provision of this information has	
	been assigned or delegated to a third	
	party, in accordance with [] the	
	Balancing Guideline adopted on the	
	basis of Article 18 of the Regulation	
	714/2009Article, those parties will be	
	responsible for meeting the	
	requirements of this Article.	

5. Day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 6(3)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Art. 6(3) day-ahead and intraday markets 3. Market operators shall be free to develop products and trading opportunities that suit market participants' demand and needs and ensure that all market participants are able to access the market individually or through aggregation. They shall respect the need to accommodate increasing shares of variable generation as well as increased demand responsiveness and the advent of new technologies.	3. Market operators shall be free to develop products and trading opportunities that suit market participants' demand and needs and ensure that all market participants are able to access the market individually or through aggregation. They shall respect the need to accommodate increasing shares of variable generation and energy storage as well as increased demand responsiveness and the advent of new technologies.	[deleted]	Art. 6(3): Market operators, such as NEMOs, need to be given sufficient flexibility to develop innovative and competitive products as well as trading opportunities suiting market participants' needs, as initially foreseen in the Commission's proposal (Art. 6(3)). Naturally, this flexibility to implement products would be subject to the fulfilment of all relevant regulation.



6. Trade on day-ahead and intraday markets: Art. 7(1)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Art. 7(1) Trade on day-ahead and intraday markets	1. Market operators shall allow market participants to trade energy as close to	1. Nominated electricity market operators shall allow market	Art. 7(1): As Commission.
1. Market operators shall allow market participants to trade energy as close to real time as possible and at least up to	real time as possible and at least up to 15 minutes before real time across all bidding zones.	participants to trade energy as close to real time as possible and at least up to the intraday cross-zonal gate closure	Justification: The Parliament's positions on gate closure time is in direct contradiction to some of the
the intraday cross-zonal gate closure time determined in accordance with Article 59 of Regulation (EU) 2015/1222.	 Market operators shall provide market participants with the opportunity to trade in energy in 	time determined in accordance with [] the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU)	arrangements being developed under the Electricity Balancing Guideline (EB GL), which came into force only 5 months ago. The 15-minute gate closure
 Market operators shall provide market participants with the opportunity to trade in energy in time 	national and cross- border markets in time intervals at least as short as the imbalance settlement period in both	714/2009. 2. Nominated electricity market operators shall provide market	text cuts across the proposal for the intraday cross-zonal gate closure time, which has recently been set at one hour before the start of each market time unit
intervals at least as short as the imbalance settlement period in both day-ahead and intraday markets.	day-ahead and intraday markets. 3. Market operators shall provide products for trading in day-ahead and	participants with the opportunity to trade in energy in time intervals at least as short as the imbalance settlement	on most bidding zone borders by ACER following a proposal of the TSOs to the detriment of NEMOs.
 Market operators shall provide products for trading in day-ahead and intraday markets which are sufficiently 	intraday markets which are sufficiently small in size, with minimum bid sizes of 500 Kilowatt, to allow for the effective participation of demand-side response,	period in both day-ahead and intraday markets in accordance with [] the balancing guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU)	The Commission's text allows for a gradual evolution of the intraday cross- zonal gate closure time (IDCZGCT)
small in size, with minimum bid sizes of 1 Megawatt or less, to allow for the effective participation of demand-side response, energy storage and small-	energy storage and small-scale renewables including directly by customers.	714/2009. 3. Nominated electricity market operators shall provide products for	depending on the reality of the market. Such an evolution may have an impact on the European balancing platform for replacement reserve which
scale renewables.	4. By 1 January 2021 , the imbalance settlement period shall be 15 minutes in all control areas.	trading in day-ahead and intraday markets which are sufficiently small in size, with minimum bid sizes of 1 Megawatt [], to allow for the effective	is currently under development. Art. 7(3): Market operators shall provide products for trading in day-



4. By 1 January 2025, the imbalance	participation of demand-side response,	ahead and intraday markets which are
settlement period shall be 15 minutes	energy storage and small-scale	sufficiently small in size , with minimum
in all control areas.	renewables in accordance to the	bid sizes of 1 Megawatt or less, to
	methodologies developed in the []	allow for the effective participation of
	capacity allocation and congestion	demand-side response, energy storage
	management guideline adopted on the	and small-scale renewables.
	basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU)	
	714/2009.	Justification: There is no reason to
		stipulate minimum or, for that matter,
	4. [] By 1 January 2021, the imbalance	maximum size of bids in day-ahead or
	settlement period shall be 15 minutes	intraday markets in the regulation.
	in all [] scheduling areas unless []	Currently at least ranges between 0.1
	regulatory authorities have granted a	and 1.0 MWh/h are used. The minimum
	derogation or an exemption in	limits used should be freely adaptable
	accordance with [] the balancing	based on the evolution of the markets,
	guideline adopted on the basis of	while respecting any technical limits that
	Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009.	may apply to handle the price formation.
	[]	
		Art. 7(4): As Council.
		Justification: Both the proposal made by
		European Commission and the
		Parliament's amendments are in
		contradiction to other legislation
		currently in force, particularly Art. 53 (1)
		and Art. 62 (1) of the Electricity
		Balancing Guideline (EB GL). Keeping
		different provisions and subsequent
		deadlines in two EU legislative acts
		creates legal inconsistency and
		confusion for the market.
		confusion for the market.



7. Dispatching of generation and demand response: Art. 11

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
 Dispatching of generation and demand response (Art. 11) 1. Dispatching of power generation facilities and demand response shall be non-discriminatory and market based unless otherwise provided under paragraphs 2 to 4. 2. When dispatching electricity generating installations, transmission system operators shall give priority to generating installations using renewable energy sources or high- efficiency cogeneration from small generating installations using emerging technologies to the following extent: (a) generating installations using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 500 kW; or (b) demonstration projects for innovative technologies. 	 2(a) generating installations using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than 500 kW; (b) generating installations which are demonstration projects for innovative technologies; Member States may apply higher limits to local energy communities as established in the Directive (EU) [recast of Directive 2009/72/EC as proposed by COM(2016) 864/2]. 	 1.Dispatching of power generation facilities and demand response shall be non- discriminatory, transparent and, unless otherwise provided under Article 11 (2) to Article 11 (4), market based. [] 2.[] Without prejudice to [] Articles 107 to 109 TFEU Member States may provide for electricity generated [] using renewable energy sources or high-efficiency cogeneration from small [] power generating facility or power generating facility using emerging technologies to be granted priority dispatch up to the following extent: (a) [] power generating facility using renewable energy sources or high- efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than [] 250 kW; or (b) demonstration projects for emerging [] technologies as defined [] in the network code on requirements 	 Art. 11(2) (a) [] power generating facility using renewable energy sources or high efficiency cogeneration with an installed electricity capacity of less than [] 250 kW; or Justification: All technologies must compete fairly in the market, which includes market-based dispatching. A properly functioning intraday and balancing market, combined with market-based and non-discriminatory rules for curtailment effectively removes the need for priority dispatch. This approach is the most efficient and ensures the lowest cost to the consumer. As renewable generation rapidly grows and becomes increasingly cost- competitive, it is vital to ensure the cost- efficient market integration of renewables at this stage.



	for generators adopted on the basis of Article 6 of Regulation 714/2009.	
	0	

8. Definition of bidding zones: Art. 13

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) Document: 15879/17	Europex position
Definition of bidding zones (Art. 13) 1. Bidding zone borders shall be based on long-term, structural congestions in the transmission network and bidding zones shall not contain such congestions. The configuration of bidding zones in the Union shall be designed in such a way as to maximise economic efficiency and cross-border trading opportunities while maintaining security of supply. []	1. The configuration of bidding zones in the Union shall be designed in such a way as to ensure liquidity of day- ahead and intraday markets, and thus to maximise economic efficiency and cross- border trading opportunities while maintaining security of supply. Bidding zone borders shall be based on long-term, structural congestions in the transmission network and bidding zones shall not contain such congestions unless they have no impact on neighbouring bidding zones, or their impact is mitigated by remedial actions. []	Measures to address congestion and definition of bidding zones (Art. 13) 1. Member States shall take all appropriate measures to [] address congestions. Bidding zone borders shall be based on long-term, structural congestions in the transmission network []. Bidding zones shall not contain such structural congestions unless they have no impact, or their impact on neighbouring bidding zones is mitigated through the use of remedial actions and they do not lead to reductions of cross zonal trading capacity. The configuration of the bidding zones in the Union shall be designed in such a way as to maximise economic efficiency and in order to maximise cross-border trading	 Art. 13: Any bidding zone configuration needs to take into account existing long-term structural congestion. However, it is also imperative to consider the impacts of any changes on the stability of markets. It is also key to consider not only splitting of bidding zones but also mergers where they are justified. Europex welcomes the Council's position to take all appropriate measures to address congestions, to avoid reductions of cross-zonal trading capacity and to maximise cross-border trading opportunities. Maximising cross-zonal trading capacity available to the market is of vital importance. When it comes to bidding zones configuration, predictability is crucial for trading confidence. For more



	opportunities, [] with due respect to the provisions in Article 14.	details about how this is ensured, see Europex' position on Article 14 below.
	[]	Europex welcomes the Parliament's recognition of the need for a reliable market environment when assessing current bidding zones.

9. General principles of capacity allocation and congestion management: Art. 14

Commission proposal	European Parliament (ITRE	Council (General Approach	Europex position
COM(2016) 861 final/2 published	report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	published 20 Dec 2017)	
23 Feb 2017		Document: 15879/17	
Conceret aviatiates of "			
General principles of capacity allocation and congestion management	3. The maximum capacity of the	3. Unless otherwise provided in	Art. 14(3): Europex supports the principle stated in Article 16(3) of
(Art. 14)	interconnections and/or the	paragraphs 7, 7a, 7b, 7d and [], 2a the	Regulation 714/2009 and confirmed by
	transmission networks affecting cross-	maximum level of capacity of the	the Commission in Article 14(3) of the
3. The maximum capacity of the	border flows shall be made available to	interconnections and/or the	proposal which calls for 'The maximum
interconnections and/or the	market participants, complying with	transmission networks affected by	capacity of the interconnections and/or
transmission networks affecting cross-	safety standards of secure network	cross- border [] capacity shall be made	the transmission networks affecting
border flows shall be made available to	operation. Counter-trading and	available to market participants,	cross-border flows shall be made
market participants, complying with safety standards of secure network	redispatch, including cross-border redispatch, shall be used to maximise	complying with safety standards of secure network operation. [] Counter-	available to market participants, complying with safety standards of
operation. Counter-trading and	available capacities unless it is	trading and redispatch, including cross-	secure network operation. Counter-
redispatch, including cross-border	demonstrated that it is not beneficial to	border redispatch, shall be used to	trading and redispatch, including cross-
redispatch, shall be used to maximise	economic efficiency at Union level.	optimize available capacities [] and a	border redispatch, shall be used to
available capacities unless it is		coordinated and non-discriminatory	maximise available capacities unless it is
demonstrated that it is not beneficial to	When allocating cost of remedial	process for cross-border remedial	demonstrated that it is not beneficial to
economic efficiency at Union level.	actions between transmission system	actions shall be applied to enable this,	economic efficiency at Union level'
	operators, regulators shall analyse to	following the implementation of the re-	
	what extent unscheduled flows leaving	dispatching and countertrading cost	



7. Transmission system operators shall not limit the volume of interconnection capacity to be made available to other market participants in order to solve congestion inside their own control area or as a means of managing flows on a border between two control areas observed even without any transaction, that is to say flows over control areas caused by origin and destination within one control area.

Upon request by a transmission system operator, the relevant regulatory authority may grant a derogation from the first subparagraph where it is necessary for maintaining operational security or where it is beneficial to economic efficiency at Union level. Such a derogation, which may not relate to curtailment of already allocated capacities pursuant to paragraph 5, shall be limited in time, strictly limited to what is necessary, and avoid discrimination between internal and cross-zonal exchanges. Before granting a derogation, the relevant regulatory authority shall consult the regulatory authorities of other Member States forming part of an affected capacity calculation region. In case a regulatory authority disagrees with the proposed derogation, the Agency shall decide on the derogation pursuant to Article 6(8)(a) [recast of Regulation (EC) No 713/2009 as proposed by COM(2016)

and re- entering a bidding zone contribute to the congestion observed between two bidding zones and allocate the counter-trading and redispatch costs in proportion to their contribution to the congestion.

7. Transmission system operators shall not limit the volume of interconnection capacity to be made available to other market participants in order to solve congestion inside their own control area or as a means of managing flows on a border between two control areas observed even without any transaction, that is to say flows over control areas caused by origin and destination within one control area.

Without prejudice to the forth subparagraph of Article 13(5), this paragraph shall be considered to be complied with if the following minimum levels of available capacity for cross-zonal trade, which is calculated pursuant to the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009 taking account of contingencies, are reached:

(i) for borders using a coordinated net transfer capacity approach, if at least 75 % of the net transfer capacity pursuant to capacity allocation and congestion

sharing methodology in accordance with [] the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009 [].

7. Transmission system operators [] shall not limit the volume of interconnection capacity to be made available to [] market participants in order to solve congestion inside their own bidding zone [] or as a means of managing flows leaving and re-entering the same bidding zone without being scheduled unless otherwise provided under paragraph 7a or 7b.

Without prejudice to the application of the derogations under paragraph 7a and 7b, this paragraph shall be considered to be complied with if the following minimum levels of available capacity for cross-zonal trade, which is calculated pursuant to the capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of Regulation (EU) 714/2009 taking account of N-1 criterion, are reached:

(i) For borders using a coordinated net transmission capacity approach, 75% of the net transfer capacity pursuant to capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the It is crucial to have continuous transparency on the underlying reasons and justifications for any cross zonal capacity restrictions linked to the competitive markets, e.g. forward, dayahead and intraday.

			Europex
863/2]. The justification and reasons for the derogation shall be published. Where a derogation is granted, the relevant transmission system operators shall develop and publish a methodology and projects that shall provide a long- term solution to the issue that the derogation seeks to address. The derogation shall expire when the time limit is reached or, once the solution is applied, whichever is earlier.	the flow-based calculation at least 75 %	 basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009; (ii) For borders using a flow-based approach, 75% of the remaining available margin on internal and cross border critical network elements made available for cross border flows pursuant to capacity allocation and congestion management guideline adopted on the basis of Article 18 of the Regulation 714/2009. The derogations pursuant to paragraph 7a shall not result with a value below this threshold. 7a. [] Based on a proposal by all transmission system operators of a capacity calculation region , the relevant [] regulatory authorities by way of derogation from paragraph 7 [] shall approve [] the level of [] total available cross-zonal capacity at each bidding zone border, [] which shall be used in the capacity calculation methodology, to take account of cross-zonal unscheduled flows to the extent that could be expected [] without structural congestions in a bidding zone. [] (Part of 7, moved as 7b below) 7b. Upon request by [] transmission 	

system operators of a capacity



calculation region [] the relevant
regulatory authorities may grant a
derogation from [] paragraph 7 for
foreseeable reasons [] where it is
necessary for maintaining operational
security other than the ones covered
under paragraph 7a, for instance in
case of grid maintenance measures. []
Such a derogation, which may not
relate to curtailment of already
allocated capacities pursuant to
paragraph 5, shall be limited [] to one
year at a time, or up to maximum []
two years with a significantly
decreasing level of the derogation each
year, strictly limited to what is
necessary, and avoid discrimination
between internal and cross-zonal
exchanges. [] The justification and
reasons for the derogation shall be
published. Where a derogation is
granted, the relevant transmission
system operators shall develop and
publish a methodology and projects []
that shall provide a long-term solution
to the issue that the derogation seeks
to address. The derogation shall expire
when the time limit is reached or, once
the solution is applied, whichever is
earlier.



10. Capacity remuneration mechanisms: Arts. 23 and 24

Commission proposal COM(2016) 861 final/2 published	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017)	Europex position
23 Feb 2017		Document: 15879/17	
Capacity remuneration mechanisms (Art. 23) 3. Capacity mechanisms shall not create unnecessary market distortions and not limit cross-border trade. The amount of capacity committed in the mechanism shall not go beyond what is necessary to address the concern. 4. Generation capacity for which a final investment decision has been made after [OP: entry into force] shall only be eligible to participate in a capacity mechanism if its emissions are below 550 gr CO2/kWh. Generation capacity emitting 550 gr CO2/kWh or more shall not be committed in capacity mechanisms 5 years after the entry into force of this Regulation.	Any capacity mechanism shall: (a) not create undue market distortions and not limit cross-border trade; (b) not go beyond what is necessary to address the adequacy concern; (c) select capacity providers by means of a transparent, non-discriminatory and market-based process; (d) be technology neutral; (e) provide incentives for capacity providers to be available in times of expected system stress; (f) ensure that the remuneration is determined through a market-based process; (g) set out the required technical conditions for the participation of capacity providers in advance of the	2a. When a capacity mechanism is designed as a strategic reserve, resources in the strategic reserve shall only be dispatched in case transmission system operators [] are likely to exhaust[] their balancing resources to establish an equilibrium between demand and supply []. This requirement is without prejudice to activating resources ahead of actual dispatch in order to respect their ramping constraints and operating requirements. During periods where resources in the strategic reserve were dispatched imbalances in the market shall be settled at least at the bidding limit pursuant to Article 9 []. The [] resources taking part in the strategic reserve shall not get remunerated	 Art. 23: A properly functioning energy market minimises the need for capacity remuneration mechanisms, and maximises welfare for the European consumer. Capacity mechanisms should be implemented only as a last resort, and only after both a national and regional and preferably also a European adequacy assessment have been carried out, clearly demonstrating a need which cannot be met in any other secure way. The approach taken by the Parliament in Article 18a 'General principles for capacity mechanisms' is in line with this – i.e. to <i>not</i> introduce a capacity mechanism where the adequacy concern has not identified a need, or
5. Where the European resource adequacy assessment has not identified a resource adequacy concern, Member States shall not apply capacity mechanisms.	selection process; (h) be open to participation of all resources, including storage and demand side management that are capable of providing the required technical performance;	 through [] wholesale electricity markets or balancing markets. 3. Capacity mechanisms shall: (a) not create unnecessary market distortions and not limit cross [] zonal trade; 	where the detailed implementation plan to address adequacy concerns as required under Article 18(3) has not received a positive decision from the Commission. Europex welcomes the additional
		b) be market-based;	actions proposed by the Parliament in



	ly appropriate penalties to	(c) be open to participation of all	Article 18(3) to address adequacy
	ty providers when not available	resources that are capable of providing	concerns, and considers these as
	event of system stress;	the required technical performance in	necessary conditions for properly
	ure that capacity contracts for	a technology neutral manner and	functioning markets.
	g installations are rewarded for	through fair and transparent rules,	
a maxi	mum length of 1 year.	including but not limited to	The proposed detailing of limits on
		participation of storage, energy	strategic reserves in the Parliament's
	acity mechanisms in the form of	efficiency and demand response [];	proposal has flaws which we would like
strateg	gic reserves shall:		to be re-considered as follows:
		(d) be temporary, but are permitted, in	There should not be additional
(a) be l	held outside the market;	accordance with state aid rules, as long	limitations placed on strategic
		as the relevant resource adequacy	reserves versus how other
(b) be	dispatched only where day-	assessment identifies a resource	capacity mechanisms may be
ahead	and intraday markets have	adequacy concern;	applied.
failed t	to clear and transmission system		• Thus, as an example: While we
operat	ors have exhausted their	(e) [] not go beyond what is necessary	agree that capacity
balanc	ing resources to establish an	to address the resource adequacy	mechanisms should not
equilib	rium between demand and	concern.	interfere with the ordinary free
supply	;	0	, markets, there should be an
			allowance for activation of
(c) ens	ure that during periods where	4. [] In the design of a capacity	Strategic Reserves as a last
	gic reserves were dispatched,	mechanism, Member States shall apply	resort measure linked to the
imbala	nces are settled at the technical	the following requirements regarding	organized markets after all
price li	mit applied by the market	CO2 emission limits:	ordinary orders have been
-	ors pursuant to Article 9 or at		utilised, e.g. at the maximum
	ue of lost load, whichever the	(a) Generation capacity emitting more	(harmonised) clearing price
higher		than 550 gr CO2/kWh of energy or	limit in the markets. The
		more than 700 kg CO2 on average per	reason being, among others,
(d) be	limited to maximum emissions	year per installed kW for which a final	that a significant share of the
	kg/CO2/kW for the electricity	investment decision has been made	production and consumption
	tion per year. The electricity	after [OP: date of entry into force] shall	reserves are of the type that
	ted, or the load reduction	not receive payments or commitments	require a reasonable lead time
-	ed by resources in the strategic	for future payments under a capacity	(X hours) before activation to
	e shall not be sold through	mechanism as of 31 December 2025.	manage efficiently from
	sale electricity markets.		economic and system security
	,		perspective.
			perspective.



	 3. In addition to the requirements laid down in paragraph 1, capacity mechanisms other than strategic reserves shall: (a) be constructed so as to ensure that the price paid for availability automatically tends to zero when the level of capacity supplied is expected to be adequate to meet the level of capacity demanded; (b) remunerate the participating resources merely for their availability and ensure that the remuneration does not affect decisions of the capacity provider whether or not to generate; (c) ensure that capacity obligations are transferable between eligible capacity providers. 	 (b) Generation capacity emitting more than 550 gr CO2/kWh of energy or more than 700 kg CO2 on average per year per installed kW for which a final investment decision has been made before [<i>OP: date of entry into force</i>] shall not receive payments or commitments for future payments under a capacity mechanism as of 31 December 2030, except for contracts with a remaining duration of not more than 5 years concluded before 31 December 2030. Between 31 December 2025 and 31 December 2030, the capacity receiving remuneration for this participation should be reduced by 5% per year. (c) The emission limit of 550 gr CO2/kWh of energy and the limit of 700 kg CO2 on average per year per installed kW shall be calculated based on the design efficiency of the generation unit as provided by an accredited certification organisation. 	Art. 23(4): We disagree with provisions for maximum emission limits for capacity mechanism resources. All market related arrangements should be technology neutral; thus, the functioning of the market clearing and power system balancing should not be subject to limits on which resources can be used, not least since there are costs placed on resources emitting CO2 and other pollutants via other mechanisms.
Art. 24 Existing mechanisms Member States applying capacity mechanisms on [OP: entry into force of this Regulation] shall adapt their mechanisms to comply with Articles 18, 21 and 23 of this Regulation.	Member States applying capacity mechanisms on [OP: entry into force of this Regulation] shall adapt their mechanisms to comply with Articles 18, 18a , 21 and 23 of this Regulation.	Member States applying capacity mechanisms on [OP: <i>entry into force of</i> <i>this Regulation</i>] shall adapt their mechanisms to comply with Articles 18, 21 and 23 of this Regulation [] without prejudice to commitments or contracts, concluded before that date, and without prejudice to the Union State aid rules pursuant to Articles 107 to 109 TFEU, including state aid	In order to avoid regulatory uncertainty, and to ensure legal security and predictability, this provision should only apply to mechanisms which have not already been approved by the Commission under the Energy and Environment State Aid Guidelines.



	decisions taken thereafter before that	
	date.	



Draft recast of the Electricity Directive

11. Market based supply prices: Art. 5

Commission proposal COM(2016) 864 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) 15886/17	Europex position
Market based supply prices (Art. 5) 3. By way of derogation from paragraphs 1 and 2, Member States which apply public interventions in price setting for the supply of electricity for energy poor or vulnerable household customers at the [OP: please insert the date of entry into force of this Directive] may continue to apply such public interventions until [OP: insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this Directive]. Such public interventions shall pursue a general economic interest, be clearly defined, transparent, non-discriminatory, verifiable and guarantee equal access for Union electricity companies to customers. The interventions shall not go beyond what is necessary to achieve the general economic interest which they pursue, be limited in time and proportionate as regards their beneficiaries.	 4. Between [OP – insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this Directive] and [OP – insert the date – ten years from the entry into force of this Directive], Member States may still apply public interventions in the pricesetting for the supply of electricity for vulnerable household customers. Such interventions shall comply with all the following conditions: (a) they shall not go beyond what is necessary to achieve the general economic interest which they pursue; (b) they shall be limited in time; (c) they shall be limited in time; (d) they shall be limited to energy poor and vulnerable customers; 	 3. By way of derogation from paragraphs 1 and 2, Member States [] may apply public interventions in price setting for the supply of electricity subject to the conditions in paragraphs 3a and 3b []. 3a. [] Public interventions pursuant to paragraph 3 shall: (a) pursue a general economic interest; (b) be clearly defined, transparent, non- discriminatory and verifiable []; (c) guarantee equal access for Union electricity companies to customers. The interventions shall not go beyond what is necessary to achieve the general economic interest which they pursue, (d) be limited in time and proportionate as regards their beneficiaries. 	Art. 5(4): After[OP – insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this Directive], Member States may still apply public interventions in the price setting for the supply of electricity for vulnerable household customers in so far as it is strictly necessary for reasons of extreme urgency. Such interventions shall comply with the conditions set out in paragraph 3. [···] Justification: Regulated electricity supply (retail) prices prevent fair competition, hamper new market entrants, discourage innovation and ultimately prevent consumers from getting the best deal. The possibility of intervening in (end user) price setting in the draft recast of the Electricity Directive should be categorically excluded and existing



4. After[OP – insert the date – five years from the entry into force of this	(e) they shall not impede market entry by new participants;	3b. Public interventions pursuant to paragraph 3 shall:	interventions should urgently be phased out.
Directive], Member States may still apply public interventions in the price- setting for the supply of electricity for	(f) they shall not negatively impact the wholesale electricity market;	(-a) avoid influencing the wholesale electricity market;	The Council's proposal of introducing unspecified wholesale market price setting safeguards is insufficient and
vulnerable household customers in so far as it is strictly necessary for reasons of extreme urgency. Such interventions shall comply with the conditions set out	(g) they shall not result in additional costs for market participants in a discriminatory way; and	(a) not result in additional costs for market participants in a discriminatory way;	potentially misleading.
in paragraph 3.	(h) all beneficiaries of such public intervention shall have the possibility	(b) not lead to direct cross- subsidisation between customers	
Member States shall notify the measures taken in accordance with the first subparagraph to the Commission within one month after adoption and	to choose competitive market offers and shall be directly informed of the availability of offers and savings on the competitive market, in particular	supplied at free market prices and those supplied at regulated supply prices;	
may apply them immediately. The notification shall be accompanied by an explanation why other instruments	dynamic electricity price contracts, at least every quarter and they shall be provided with assistance to switch to a	(c) ensure that all beneficiaries of such public intervention have the possibility to choose competitive market offers	
could not sufficiently address the situation and how the beneficiaries and the duration of the measure have been	market based offer.	and are directly informed of the availability of offers and savings on the competitive market, in particular	
determined. The notification shall be considered as complete if, within two months from its receipt, or from the receipt of any additional information		dynamic electricity price contracts, at least every quarter and that they are provided with assistance to switch to a market based offer;	
requested, the Commission does not request any further information.		(d) ensure that, pursuant to Article 19 and 21, all beneficiaries of such public	
The Commission may take a decision asking the national authorities to amend or withdraw the measures		interventions are entitled to and are offered to have smart meters being installed at no extra costs for these	
within two months from receipt of a complete notification where it considers that the requirements set out in the first subparagraph are not		customers and are directly informed of the possibility to install smart meters	



fulfilled. The decision-making period	and are provided with necessary	
can be extended with the consent of	assistance.	
both the Commission and the Member		
State concerned.	[]	
The public intervention applied on the basis of this paragraph shall be deemed valid as long as the Commission has not taken a decision asking the national authorities to amend or withdraw the measure.		

12. Tasks of distribution system operators in the use of flexibility: Art. 32(1) para 2

Commission proposal COM(2016) 864 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) 15886/17	Europex position
Tasks of distribution system operators in the use of flexibility – Art. 32(1) para 2	Standardised market products for such services shall be defined at least at the national level. Distribution system operators shall, in a transparent and	1a. Distribution system operators subject to an oversight by the regulatory authority, or the regulatory authority itself, shall define [] the	Art. 32(1): As Council. Justification: Competition among all types of resources and easy market-
Distribution system operators shall define standardised market products for the services procured ensuring effective participation of all market	participatory process that includes all relevant system users, the national regulatory authority and the transmission system operator, define	specifications for the flexibility services procured in close cooperation with the transmission system operators. The specifications shall ensure an []	access driven by market-based solutions are the most efficient way to enable and deliver flexibility.
participants including renewable energy sources, demand response, and aggregators. Distribution system operators shall exchange all necessary information and coordinate with	standardised market products for the services procured ensuring effective participation of all market participants including renewable energy sources, demand response, storage and	effective and non-discriminatory participation of all market participants including renewable energy sources, demand response, energy storage facilities and []market participants	The integration and optimal use of flexibility will be a key ingredient of the future power market. Reliable wholesale price signals exhibit an efficient signal to steer activity.



13. Tasks of transmission system operators: Art. 40 (4) and (5)

Commission proposal COM(2016) 864 final/2 published 23 Feb 2017	European Parliament (ITRE report as voted 21 Feb 2018)	Council (General Approach published 20 Dec 2017) 15886/17	Europex position
 Tasks of transmission system operators Art. 40 4. In performing the task described in point (i) of paragraph 1, the 	5a. Member States shall provide the necessary regulatory framework to allow and incentivise transmission system operators to procure services in order to improve efficiencies in the	4. In performing the task described in point (i) of paragraph 1, the transmission system operators shall []	Art. 40: See position on Art 32(1)



transmission system operator shall	operation and development of the	procure balancing services [] according	
ensure that the procurement of	transmission system, including local	to:	
balancing services and, unless justified	congestion management. In particular,		
by a cost-benefit analysis, non-	regulatory frameworks shall ensure	(a) transparent, non-discriminatory and	
frequency ancillary services, is:	that transmission system operators	market-based procedures ;	
	can procure services from resources		
(a) transparent, non-discriminatory and	such as demand response or storage	(b) ensures effective participation of all	
market-based;	and consider energy efficiency	qualified electricity undertakings and	
	measures, when such services cost-	market participants including	
(b) ensures effective participation of all	effectively supplant the need to	renewable energy sources, demand	
market participants including	upgrade or replace electricity capacity	response, energy storage facilities and	
renewable energy sources, demand	and which support the efficient and	[] market participants engaged in	
response, energy storage facilities and	secure operation of the transmission	aggregation. For that purpose, []	
aggregators, in particular by requiring	system. Transmission system operators	regulatory authorities [] and	
regulatory authorities or transmission	shall procure those services in	transmission system operators shall, in	
system operators in close cooperation	accordance with transparent, non-	close cooperation with all market	
with all market participants, to define	discriminatory and market based	participants, [] define technical	
technical modalities for participation in	procedures.	modalities for participation in these	
these markets on the basis of the		markets on the basis of the technical	
technical requirements of these	[]	requirements of these markets in	
markets and the capabilities of all		accordance with the Commission	
market participants.		Regulation 2017/1485 establishing a	
		guideline on electricity transmission	
5. Transmission system operators shall		system operation [].	
not own assets that provide ancillary			
services save under the conditions set		5. []	
out in Article 54.			
		5a. The requirements of paragraph 4	
		shall apply to the provision of those	
		non-frequency ancillary services by	
		transmission system operators, unless	
		the regulatory authority has assessed	
		that the market-based provision of	
		non-frequency ancillary services is	



	economically not efficient and has granted a derogation.	
	5b. This obligation to procure non- frequency ancillary services does not apply to fully integrated network components.	

About

Europex is a not-for-profit association of European energy exchanges with 26 members. It represents the interests of exchange-based wholesale electricity, gas and environmental markets, focuses on developments of the European regulatory framework for wholesale energy trading and provides a discussion platform at European level.

Contact

Europex – Association of European Energy Exchanges Address: Rue Archimède 44, 1000 Brussels, Belgium Phone: +32 2 512 34 10 Website: <u>www.europex.org</u> Email: <u>secretariat@europex.org</u> Twitter: Europex_energy